

SUBCOMMITTEE NO. 1

Agenda

Senator Marty Block, Chair
Senator Benjamin Allen
Senator John M. W. Moorlach



Tuesday, November 1, 2016
10:00 a.m.
San Diego City College
Corporate Education Center Auditorium
151 C Street, San Diego, CA 92101

Consultant: Anita Lee

Informational Hearing
Senate Bill 850 (Block) Community College Baccalaureate Degree Implementation

Panels

- I. California's Demand for Bachelor's Degrees
 - Dr. Patrick J. Murphy, Director of Research and Senior Fellow, Public Policy Institute of California
 - Dr. Larry Galizio, President, Community College League of California
- II. Local Workforce Needs
 - Hernán Luis y Prado, Founder and President, Workshops for Warriors
 - Andy Hall, Vice President and Chief Program Officer, San Diego Workforce Partnership
 - Dr. Nabil Abu-Ghazaleh, President, Grossmont College
- III. Senate Bill 850 Status of Implementation and Future Opportunities
 - Dr. Pamela D. Walker, Vice Chancellor of Educational Services, California Community College Chancellor's Office
 - Dr. Constance Carroll, Chancellor, San Diego Community College District
 - Dr. Sunita V. Cooke, Superintendent / President, Mira Costa Community College District
 - Dr. Ding-Jo Currie, Professor, California State University, Fullerton

Public Comment

Pursuant to the Americans with Disabilities Act, individuals who, because of a disability, need special assistance to attend or participate in a Senate Committee hearing, or in connection with other Senate services, may request assistance at the Senate Rules Committee, 1020 N Street, Suite 255 or by calling (916) 651-1505. Requests should be made one week in advance whenever possible.

BACKGROUND PAPER

The California Community Colleges (CCC) is the largest system of community college education in the United States, serving approximately 2.1 million students annually, with 1.2 million full-time equivalent students. The CCC system is made up of 113 colleges operated by 72 community college districts throughout the state. California's two-year institutions provide programs of study and courses, in both credit and noncredit categories, which address its three primary areas of mission: education leading to associates degrees and university transfer; career technical education; and, basic skills. The community colleges also offer a wide range of programs and courses to support economic development and specialized populations.

As outlined in the Master Plan for Higher Education in 1960, the community colleges were designated to have an open admission policy and bear the most extensive responsibility for lower-division, undergraduate instruction. The community college mission was further revised with the passage of Assembly Bill 1725 (Vasconcellos), Chapter 973, Statutes of 1988, which called for comprehensive reforms in every aspect of community college education and organization.

Coming out of the recession, California's universities face numerous critical issues that impact the state's ability to meet educational and workforce demands. In particular, the Public Policy Institute of California (PPIC) released a report, *Addressing California's Skills Gap*, which found that, if current trends in the labor market and educational attainment trends persist, California will face a large skills gap by 2030 - 1.1 million workers with bachelor's degrees short of economic demand. Without more students entering and completing a college degree, California will not meet workforce demands in the future. Additionally, the PPIC notes that in 2013 workers with a bachelor's degree earned about 70 percent more than otherwise similar workers with only a high school diploma.

According to the *Doing What Matters for Jobs and the Economy* framework at the Chancellor's Office, San Diego/ Imperial region's priority job sectors include health, advanced transportation and renewables, and life sciences/ biotech. The San Diego Workforce Partnership released a report in November 2015, *Priority Sectors Workforce Initiatives in San Diego County*, which highlights various workforce challenges and initiatives in San Diego County. In particular, the report noted that health care has the largest employment numbers of the priority sectors, with approximately 6,500 health care companies employing more than 100,000 workers in San Diego County. The healthcare sector is comprised of ambulatory health care services, hospitals and nursing, and long-term care. From 2015 to 2019, the report notes there is a projected job growth of 13 percent or 13,500 jobs, and that 57 percent of employers surveyed have already reported moderate to serious shortage of qualified applicants. Additionally, one-fifth of the existing workforce is 55 years or older, and employment demand is expected to significantly increase as incumbent workers reach retirement age.

Legislation

In an effort to address California's workforce demands, the Legislature passed Senate Bill 850 (Block), Chapter 747, Statutes of 2014, and established the community college baccalaureate

degree pilot program at 15 CCC districts. The CCC Board of Governors (BOG) must consult with the California State University (CSU) and the University of California (UC) in establishing the program, and districts must receive approval from the appropriate accreditation body. Under SB 850, a district may offer only one baccalaureate degree program at one campus within the district. Additionally, districts must identify and document unmet workforce needs and to not offer a program already offered by CSU or UC.

Under SB 850, student fees for upper division coursework will be equal the CCC fee (\$46 per unit) plus \$84 per unit, for a total estimated cost of about \$10,000 to obtain a bachelor's degree. The Legislative Analyst's Office will conduct interim and final evaluations on the pilot program, which are due on July 1, 2018, and July 1, 2022, respectively. The reports will include an evaluation on completion rates, if available, for each cohort of students participating in a baccalaureate degree pilot program, the impact of baccalaureate degree pilot program on underserved and underprepared students, and recommendations on whether and how the statewide baccalaureate degree pilot program can or should be extended and expanded. SB 850 will sunset on July 1, 2023.

The Assembly Appropriations Committee estimated that SB 850 will need ongoing General Fund costs to the Chancellor's Office in the range of \$350,000 for three to four staff to establish and monitor district programs, including developing guidelines and reviewing, approving, and monitoring participating districts' baccalaureate degree programs. Additionally, the Assembly Appropriations Committee notes that SB 850 may result in significant one-time and ongoing costs to participating districts for establishing and operating the programs, including any needed capital improvements and equipment purchases.

Implementation

California is the 22nd state in the nation to establish a community college baccalaureate degree program. The Chancellor's Office received 34 applications to participate in the pilot program, and according to the Chancellor's Office, some pilot colleges had to compete within their divisions on their campuses, and at their district, to be the one to submit an application to the Chancellor's Office. A team comprised of Chancellor's Office staff, a member of the business and workforce community, and community college administrators, faculty and staff from districts that did not apply to host a program, reviewed the applications. Considerations for selecting a district included geographic distribution of the pilot programs, diversity of pilot programs, ability of the district to establish a rigorous program in their proposed field, and that the proposed program will meet an unaddressed local or statewide workforce need.

Under SB 850, the four-year degree programs must be up and running by at least the 2017-18 academic year. Below is the list of colleges that were selected to participate in the pilot:

1. Antelope Valley College (airframe manufacturing technology)
2. Bakersfield College (industrial automation)
3. Cypress College (mortuary science)
4. Feather River College (equine industry)
5. Foothill College (dental hygiene)

6. Mesa College (health information management)
7. Mira Costa College (biomanufacturing)
8. Modesto Junior College (respiratory care)
9. Santa Ana College (occupational studies)
10. Shasta College (health information management)
11. Skyline College (respiratory care)
12. West Los Angeles College (dental hygiene)
13. Rio Hondo College (automotive technology)
14. Santa Monica College (interaction design)
15. Solano Community College (biotechnology)

With the exception of Solano Community College, all the colleges received approval for their substantive change request from Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges.

The chart below displays key implementation dates for SB 850:

ACTION	DATE
Release of Application to Participate in the California Community Colleges Baccalaureate Degree Pilot Program	November 21, 2014
Applicant's Webinar	December 2, 2014
Deadline for Submitting Applications	December 19, 2014
Notification of Selected Pilot Programs	January 21, 2015
Baccalaureate Degree Program Commencement	No later than 2017-2018 Academic Year
Funding Model for Baccalaureate Program submitted to Board of Governors	March 16, 2015
First Biannual Progress Report Due	September 30, 2015
Legislative Analyst's Office Interim Report Due	July 1, 2018
Legislative Analyst's Office Final Report Due	July 1, 2022
Pilot Baccalaureate Program Ends	June 30, 2023
Pilot Program Participant Final Report Due	August 31, 2023

According to the Chancellor's Office, the following colleges will begin offering classes for their baccalaureate degree pilot programs this fall: Antelope Valley, Bakersfield, Feather River, Foothill, Rio Hondo, San Diego Mesa, Santa Monica, Shasta, Skyline, and West Los Angeles.

The remaining colleges, Cypress, Mira Costa, Modesto, Santa Ana and Solano, will begin offering classes by fall 2017.

The Chancellor's Office reports that for the fall 2016, 206 students are enrolled in the baccalaureate degree pilot program. The display below provides a demographic breakdown of the students:

	Number of Students
Female	148
Male	58
African American	12
Asian	41
Caucasian	80
Hispanic	50
Mixed	12
Other	11
Age 30 and under	125
Age 31-50	66
Age 50 and over	15

Colleges and the Chancellor's Office faced several challenges when implementing SB 850. In particular, the Chancellor's Office notes that determining the rules for financial aid was complex. The California Student Aid Commission (CSAC) stated that the education code was unclear on whether or not CCC students enrolled in these new programs could receive Cal Grant assistance for upper division coursework. Previously, community college students who are Cal Grant recipients would typically have the community college enrollment fee waived through the Board of Governor's (BOG) fee waiver program. For example, community college students who receive a Cal Grant A Entitlement award would normally have their award held in reserve for up to two years until the student transfers to a four-year institution, at which time the CSAC would disburse the Cal Grant A award. According to CSAC, Cal Grant A funds have never been disbursed to a community college student since all community college fees up to this point would be covered by the BOG fee waiver. Unlike Cal Grant A students, Cal Grant B students at a community college receive an access award. However, similar to the Cal Grant A award, the portion of the Cal Grant B award that covers tuition and fees is typically waived through the BOG waiver. Presumably, a Cal Grant B access award could be disbursed to students beyond two years even if tuition is not.

In order to address this issue, Senate Bill 1314 (Block), Chapter 438, Statutes of 2016, provided clear authority to disburse Cal Grant A, Cal Grant B award funds to eligible community college students to cover upper division fees. Additionally, SB 1314 allows students enrolled in upper division coursework of a baccalaureate degree program, who meets specified requirements, to be eligible for a Middle Class Scholarship.

Additionally, as noted above, community colleges are an open access system, yet, the Chancellor's Office notes that there is a limitation on available seats for the baccalaureate programs. However, it is unclear how many students were not able to enroll due to demand,

capacity, or program selectivity. The Chancellors Office also notes that some colleges have expressed concerns that students might be apprehensive to join a baccalaureate degree program due to a fear of not completing the degree before the pilot sunsets, though it is unclear the number of students that may have not enrolled due to this issue.

The Chancellor's Office also noted that the Academic Senate passed resolutions regarding the baccalaureate degree prior to the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges (ACCJC), which led to mismatched standards. Specifically, the Academic Senate required each student to complete a minimum of six semester or nine quarter units of upper division general education courses from at least two disciplines outside of the major, one of which must have an emphasis in communication or computation. Whereas, the ACCJC policy required students complete at least nine semester units or equivalent of upper division general education coursework.

Moreover, the Academic Senate also passed a resolution regarding the minimum qualifications for faculty teaching baccalaureate curriculum prior to the ACCJC. The Academic Senate required faculty teaching upper division courses to:

1. Possess a master's degree in the discipline of their assignment; or
2. If there is not a master's degree in the discipline, and a bachelor's or associate degree is available, the faculty may either have a master's degree and two years of professional experience directly related to their teaching assignment and any appropriate licensure; or a bachelor's degree directly related to their teaching assignment, and six years of professional experience relating to their assignment and any appropriate licensure; or
3. If there is not a master's degree in the discipline, and a bachelor's or associate degree is not available, a faculty must have any master's degree and two years of experience directly in teaching assignment and any appropriate licensure; or a bachelor's degree and six years of professional experience directly related to their teaching assignment and any appropriate licensure.

This differs from the ACCJC, which requires faculty teaching upper division courses in the baccalaureate degree to have a master's degree or doctoral degree in an appropriate discipline, and in cases where a master's degree is not available for the field of study, faculty must have a bachelor's degree in the discipline, and a master's degree in any discipline, and have six years of professional experience in the field, and a commonly required industry-recognized certification or professional licensure.

The Chancellor's Office has indicated that the colleges at a minimum follow ACCJC standards; however, the Chancellor's Offices notes ongoing conversations with ACCJC and the colleges.

In November of 2015, the Bay Area Council Economic Institute published *A Roadmap for Economic Resilience*, which describes the bay area's regional economic strategy. The report highlighted SB 850, and noted that the program will create new opportunities for more students to enter the workforce with a four-year degree. The report also notes that since each district is

limited to just a single four-year degree program, it significantly dilutes the potential impact. However, as previously noted, the Legislative Analyst's Office will conduct interim and final evaluations on the pilot program, which are due on July 1, 2018, and July 1, 2022, respectively, before the pilot program sunsets in July 1, 2023. The Legislature may wish to continue to monitor the implementation of the pilot program and program outcomes.

Budget

The 2015-16 budget included trailer bill language, Senate Bill 81 (Committee on Budget and Fiscal Review), Chapter 81, Statutes of 2015, to provide \$6 million one-time Proposition 98 General Fund to support the implementation of the pilot program. The Chancellor's Office reports that each participating college received \$350,000 to spend on implementation of the program. Colleges could use these funds on equipment, space, staff, faculty, professional development, library resources, travel to conferences, and consultants.

Additionally, North Orange County Community College District (NOCCCD) received \$750,000 to assist the Chancellor's Office to provide professional development and implementation support to the 15 pilot colleges in collaboration with the Chancellor's Office and the Academic Senate. NOCCCD provided several trainings, meetings, and workshops to assist the colleges with professional development, marketing, accreditation requirements and substantive change processes, upper division curriculum development, and requirements from the Board of Governors. The Chancellor's Office will also provide regional meetings (northern and southern) where they will hold roundtable discussions and focus groups, and conduct site visits to each participating college.

The 2016-17 budget included \$2.5 million ongoing Proposition 98 General Fund to expand outreach for students from non-English speaking households and bilingual households, marketing and outreach aimed at the baccalaureate degree pilot program, and marketing and outreach aimed at increasing current and future student awareness of the BOG fee waiver. Each baccalaureate college received \$15,000 (total of \$225,000). Additionally, \$79,000 is being used by the communications division at the Chancellor's Office to create statewide marketing materials including a website, logo, and a statewide video to create awareness around the initiative.

The 2016-17 budget also required the University of California and the California State University to report by March 1, 2017, to the Department of Finance and the Legislature regarding any policy and budget changes that increase the number of bachelor's degrees at UC and CSU by 250,000 and 480,000, respectively, above current projections, by 2030. The report may include recommendations regarding changes to eligibility, increasing enrollment, or improving graduation rates. However, the budget did not require a report from the CCC system on this issue.